## 18

# 'Expanded Materials' In Late and Post Modernism

Works of 'expanded materials' arise where material exemplification is pursued beyond depiction and the usual categories of the plastic arts. Works firstly isolate novel properties or material, as collage, or aspects to an object, as in Duchamp's readymades. Other works integrate painting and sculpture, architecture and applied arts or design so that they sample larger categories, such as the plastic arts or civic functions. These projects also interact with each other. Isolations then shift in materials and aspects, integrations shift in range. In Late Modernism the change is away from industrial design, of furniture, textiles, costume, tableware and so forth, toward a closer integration with the performing arts. Isolation becomes of industrial and mechanical components for motion, or kinetics. In some cases the line between integration and isolation blurs, but by around 1960 performance is stripped to a stark minimum; motion is engineered to a standstill. Post Modernism measures a further shift in expanded materials, where integration now embraces minimal performance, literature and other recording, while isolation samples the minimal and mechanical in construction and aspects to just time or place, as a work.

Even in a longer chapter, this trajectory can only be traced in summary.[302] However it will suffice where it demonstrates how these changes coincide with the distinction drawn between Late and Post Modernism, when it covers vital works of the period and shows how changes reflect and parallel those in painting. To begin, the emphasis upon motion and machinery in sculpture is traced. Motion of course, is hardly a novelty to sculpture by the middle of the century. Prominent precedents include Duchamp's *Bicycle Wheel* (1913 - reconstituted 1964) the mobiles of Alexander Calder (1898-1976) from the early thirties onwards, as well as moving

---

[302] Since this chapter sketches developments beyond painting, to speed and simplify matters, no illustrations are provided.

parts in the works of others, such as Giacometti's *Suspended Sphere* (1930). However, where obvious machine parts are recombined, motion may be notable by its absence or irregularity. Or where regular, motion may result from novel or irregular use of parts. Motion and mechanics then are sampled for novel and multiple links, for just those properties obscured by earlier works. Late Modernism pursues the sample in two ways, the recycled and the geometric. The 'junk' sculpture of David Smith (1906-65) and Richard Stankiewicz (1922-83) for example, remake standard steel mouldings and machine parts through any number of ingenious combinations and distress. On the other hand, precision machining and pristine finishes are exploited in geometric structures in the work of the British 'Constructionists', such as Kenneth Martin (1905-84) and wife, Mary (1907-67). Neither tendency initially adopts motion, but the promptings of machine parts, indeed the functioning motors of 'junk' or the dynamics of geometry, quickly prove irresistible to some.

The work of Jean Tinguely (1925-91) introduces erratic motion through remade machinery, and in later work it generates paintings onto rolls or sheets of paper or cloth, periodic horns and other sounds, foul aromas, coloured smoke, and finally self-destruction, as in *Hommage to New York* (1960). The progressive integration of motion, sound, smell and even two-dimensionality, and the explicit singularity of motion here mark the climax of junk sculpture.[303] The geometric tendency on the other hand finds artists such as Paris-based Venezuelan Jesus-Rafael Soto (b.1923) Israeli Yaacov Agam (b.1928) and Frenchman Francois Morellet (b.1926) introducing motion to their stricter geometric constructions, and participating (along with Tinguely) in a noted exhibition at the Galerie Denise René in Paris in 1955, aptly titled *Le Mouvement.* While such works often acquire the complexity of Op Art, rigours of geometry and motion quickly prove a sterile partnership. Neither motion nor geometry advances very far by motor or mobile of stricter materials. A more expansive approach, sharing interest in shifting patterns of reflectance or light and new rather than recycled materials, arises with architectural displays such as those of Hamilton and the Independent Group at the institute of Contemporary

---

[303] On Tinguely, see Heide E. Violand-Hobi, *Jean Tinguely: Life and Work,* Munich/New York, 1995, Calvin Tompkins, *The Bride and the Batchelor: Five Masters of the Avant-Garde.* Middlesex/UK/ Ringwood/Australia/New York, 1968.

Art in London around the middle of the century, and the lighting fixtures of Fontana at the Milan Triennale (1951)

Hamilton's display *Growth and Form* (1951) dealt in micro and macroscopic scientific depiction, freely mixed in scale, origin, and technology, so that various light projections (slide, film and strobe) to various surfaces (floor, ceiling and wall, clear and occupied) interrupt and overlap and inevitably involve the shadows and motion of spectators.[304] Fontana's work wrapped over two hundred metres of neon tubing throughout the stairwell at Milan, not only providing practical illumination but a massive and complex sculpture, even drawing, that also involved the passage of spectators and their shadows.[305] Both works draw upon the readymade, the electrical, mobile and illuminated; sample a space or place more than a sculpture and its temporary or temporal dimension. Architecture, in a sense, is permitted to spill into sculpture or painting on a short-term basis, or sculpture acquires such radical dimensions by isolating architecture, briefly. Yet such work is also constrained by occasion and novelty of technology. Where materials are without obvious or entrenched application, display dwindles to no more than gimmickry. Where occasion allows greater novelty of material, display no more than meets norms.[306] The challenge in other words, quickly becomes for other places and occasions, other means or motion.

Other motion may be provided by performance. Integration of performance with the plastic arts continues the Modernist project of groups such as the Bauhaus and Constructivists, but now does not rely upon greater prominence for traditional categories of set and costume design, rather looks for a more formative role, a closer integration. Performance is now expanded by more radical notions of script or score, as in the famous *Theatre Piece No 1* (or *The Event*) (1952) by composer John

---

[304] The term display is used here to distinguish the work from exhibitions of Hamilton's work. By later standards, the work would surely be classified as an installation. This account of *Growth and Form* draws from Richard Morphet, *Richard Hamilton* (catalogue) London, 1970, pp. 20-26.

[305] On Fontana, see Sarah Whitfield, *Lucio Fontana*, Berkeley, 1999.

[306] Neon lighting however is later used in smaller, less mobile works, for example in the notational sculptures of the Greek-born woman Chryssa (b.1933) from the early sixties and in later works by artists such as Robert Morris, Dan Flavin (1933-96) Keith Sonnier (b.1941) and Bruce Nauman (b.1941), but shadow and motion are largely ignored or reduced to at most, flashing. Neon lighting is also used in the late sixties by the Los Angeles- based Robert Irwin (b.1946) and James Turrell (b.1943) to create colour and spatial illusions to architectural settings, but these works too ignore or resist motion.

Cage (1912-92) performed at the Black Mountain College in North Carolina. Or the plastic arts is now expanded by radical notions of the temporal, as in the staged or enacted paintings of Frenchman Georges Mathieu (b.1921) from the early fifties, progressively involving (standard) musical accompaniment, outdoor settings, and even television coverage.[307] Cage offers simultaneous and overlapping texts, delivered with a certain stoic restraint, together with various music, live and recorded, dance and more casual activity (including a wandering dog).[308] Mathieu matches standard music and setting, amusingly, to the production of a large-scale calligraphic abstraction, with extravagant theme and showmanship (in one performance he is costumed in a knight's armour, for example).[309] The first shifts the emphasis from starting point in script or score to arrive at a less sequential or more spatial 'performance', while the second shifts emphasis from end point or product, to arrive at a more sequential or less spatial painting. However, greater integration also surrenders its origin and mooring. Work gradually strips script and performance, painting and process to a sterile end to the period in the early sixties.

Cage's influence extends firstly through collaboration with dancer and choreographer Merce Cunningham (b.1919) and Rauschenberg. Rauschenberg's work such as *Minutiae* (1954) (figure 34) occasionally serves as props for a Cunningham dance but works also become more conspicuously freestanding, such as the stuffed goat in *Monogram* (1959) and even mobile, as in the wheels to the base

---

[307] Links between The Black Mountain College and the Bauhaus are well documented. See Paul Betts 'Black Mountain College N.C.' in *Bauhaus,* Jeannine Fiedler and Peter Feierabend (eds.) Cologne, 1999, pp. 62-65. Mathieu's stagings derive more directly from Surrealist events and tableaux, such as those at *The International Surrealist Exhibition* (1938) at the Galerie de Beaux Arts in Paris. The Independent Group and Hamilton share a strong architectural and design background that also reflects the Modernist convergence. *Growth and Form* was opened by noted French architect Le Corbusier (1887-1965) for example, while Fontana's interest in light and electrical activity as sculptural material is anticipated in the work of Bauhaus artist László Moholy-Nagy (1895-1946) as well as the earlier proposals by Futurist Luigi Russolo (1885-1947).

[308] On Cage, see Paul Griffiths, *Cage*, London/New York/Melbourne, 1981, Michael Nyman, *Experimental Music: Cage and Beyond*, London, 1974, Richard Kostelanetz (ed.) *John Cage: an anthology*, New York, 1991.

[309] Mathieu's reputation warrants defence, since it has often suffered because of his theatrical approach. The shift from 'action' painting to 'acting' painting is unfairly felt to impoverish the results. The point is surely that differences made by performance to painting are no more than latitude granted to notational means within painting. On Mathieu, see Daniel Abadie et al., *Georges Mathieu: A Retrospective Exhibition* (catalogue) Paris/Milan, 2003.

of *Gift For Apollo* (1959).[310] Rauschenberg also contributes a small machine that throws money to Tinguely's *Hommage to New York* (1960) and retains an interest in kinetics even as later practice relies more upon gimmicks. A later student of Cage, Allan Kaprow (b.1921) dispenses with musicians and dancers in his staged 'happenings' in which he and a small cast perform basic tasks of painting, wrapping or unwrapping, eating or drinking, and arranging signage or text in various discrete segments often synchronised to tapes of sound effects and more familiar music.[311] Like Cage, Kaprow favours simultaneous features or attractions, an uncertain interaction with the audience and a deadpan attitude. But significantly, Kaprow's happenings at this time, together with those of Robert Whitman (b.1935) generally occur in art galleries, and the range of activity, in avoiding standard music, dance and drama, unavoidably becomes 'about' sculpture and painting, an extension to the plastic artist's laconic or non-verbal interaction with materials. The happenings of Claes Oldenburg, (b.1929) Jim Dine (b.1935) and Red Grooms (b.1937) at the Judson Gallery in New York in 1959 and 1960 briefly further this tendency; but essentially signal the exhaustion of such performance.

Mathieu's influence surprisingly extends to Japan and the Gutai group in Tokyo and Osaka, who emerge in 1957 and pursue painting and sculpture as a performance to the point where they dispense with the completed or preserved work, and instead set themselves various comic interactions with materials treated purely as props, such as *Challenging Mud* (1955) in which Kazuo Shiraga (b.1924) crawls upon a mound of very soft mud, shaping it with his flailing legs and arms. Yet these activities do not strictly replace painting and sculpture for the group but rather serve to publicise them and the Gutai shortly return the emphasis to product over performance. The work of Frenchman Yves Klein (1928-62) similarly maintains both production and performance and wholly embraces the showmanship of Mathieu, with a distinctive costume for himself and none for his young female assistants. Klein's performed paintings such as the *Anthropometries* series (1960) reduce the artist to a mobile commander while his nude assistants obediently coat themselves in his signature blue paint and imprint themselves against a canvas. The

---

[310] Interestingly, Rauschenberg's expansion stops short of the sculpted figure or person, just as the figure and extended setting (or 'environment') in the work of George Segal (b.1924) or Edward Kienholz (1927-94) at this time stop short of greater mobility or duration.
[311] Details for this and following works draw from Adrian Henri, *Environments and Happenings,* London, 1974.

artist becomes more remote, the end product stresses anatomy over standard skills. Both artist and painting isolate or sample performance as utterance and anatomy, the performer now less an artist than a mere person or persons.[312] This radical reduction signals another end to Late Modernism, another start to Post-Modernism.

The Late Modernist phase of expanded materials thus stresses motion and duration, and counterpoints painting of the period in certain ways. The emphasis upon time and motion drives a new contrast between one-directional and multi-directional reference. 'Reciprocal Depiction' gives this directionality added weight through emphasis on 'interruption', and shifts between the abstract and the concrete, while abstraction of the period often stresses a two-way directionality through greater symmetry. Depiction and painting thus exploit certain properties relinquished by the work committed to motion and duration. A similar synchrony holds for Post-Modernism. Painting samples printing and pattern for sole and multiple instances, for variation and material to identity of a work. Works of expanded materials stress other grades to identity for a work. Yet because such works now tend to resist more obvious performance, motion and place and an end product of any permanence, work is often taken as 'de-materialised' or purely a matter of concept and so is commonly called Conceptualism or Conceptual Art.[313] This is a little misleading.

More accurately, identity for a work projected beyond the plastic arts encounters other issues. Some works are identified not with number of instances, variation and material but by compliance with rules of a language, as in literature, or notation, as in the performing arts. A poem, whether handwritten, typed or published remains the same work, as long as it complies with the rules of the language of the first instance. A music score remains the same work when performed as long as the performance and instruments comply with notation and other directions of the score. Equally, the script or score constitutes a work, even when unperformed or unperformable, unpublished or unpublishable. The difference between literature

---

[312] On Klein, see Sidra Stich, *Yves Klein*, Stuttgart, 1994, Pierre Restany, *Yves Klein*, New York, 1982.

[313] On Conceptual Art, see Tony Godfrey, *Conceptual Art*, London, 1998, Alexander Alberro, Blake Stimson (eds.) *Conceptual Art: A Critical Anthology*, Boston, 1999, Peter Osborne, *Conceptual Art,* London, 2002, Michael Newman, Jon Bird (eds.) *Rewriting Conceptual Art (critical views)*, Oxford/New York, 1999, Lucy R. Lippard, *Six Years: The Dematerialisation of the art object from 1966 to 1972*, London, 1973, Gregory Battcock (ed.) *Idea Art*, New York, 1973.

and performances on the one hand and painting and printing on the other, also means that paintings and prints may be forged in a way that performances and copies cannot.[314] The recording of a performance by means other than script or score, by photo and electrical means, presents a similar but more recent extension of identity for a work. Recordings in this sense are rarely of a single or uninterrupted performance, but typically comply with a score or script, or where this is absent, for example in improvised or folk music or tales, with such performing and recording practices in most other respects. A copy of a recording may contravene copyright but where standards of recording are sufficiently maintained, so too is identity of performance and script or score. It is a pirate or bootleg recording, but not a forgery of the work.[315] Identity for a work outside of the plastic arts is thus a graded or attenuated affair, from only script or score, to all copies that comply with original language or notation of script or score, to all compliant performances, or those from which a single script or score may be derived, to all recordings complying with script, score, performance or recording practices, and various combinations thereof. Furthermore, translations, transcriptions, adaptations and transmissions or broadcasts, by radio, television and the Internet disperse identity still further, although hardly arrive at anything as vacuous as a work of pure concept.

Expanding the materials of painting and sculpture to include motion and performance hardly exhausts these options, of course. Rather, it invites greater and more diverse engagement with them. And works are no more conceptual or dematerialised for attending to issues of script or score and recording than to sole or multiple instances, patterns or printing. 'Expanded materials' here contrast with painting in offering grades or stages to the identity of a work where printing and pattern deal in other issues of instantiation. As with the treatment of Pop Art in Chapter Fourteen, the aim here is not so much to replace or discredit the label of Conceptual Art, as to show how it is integrated within a larger project and period. The term nevertheless is stripped of loose talk of pure concepts and a

---

[314] See Goodman, *Languages of Art*, Indianapolis 1976, pp. 112-123, pp. 194-198.
[315] However the artwork and packaging – that is, design and printed elements – may be a forgery, or the impersonation of an alleged performer, may constitute an equivalent of a forgery, but neither of these then directly threaten the identity of the script or score.

'dematerialised' work, and clad instead in radical sampling of, not just script and score, performance and recording, but also duration and place.

For the Post-Modernist work of 'expanded materials' may also be a sampled place for a given duration, devoid of performance or motion. Sampling larger objects or places outside of a single building, effectively involves a fixed or short-term duration, indeed sample may be as much *of* duration (say a famous holiday) as place. So against attenuation of identity through script, score, performance and recording, the Post-Modernist work also allows performance to be graded to duration and place, and these four options are taken to comprise 'expanded materials' in Post-Modernism, or Conceptual Art, re-defined. Artists committed to the project, as in preceding periods, typically combine and switch between branches. As with the introduction of full abstraction to depiction, the results need hardly remain a dry or academic exercise. Conceptual Art extends the reach and sensitivity of sampling practices and allows a new complexity to object and sample. It may result in taking some practices *as* objects, such as scripts or 'text-only' works or as documentation or recording and elsewhere in renewed appreciation of ignored or concealed aspects to established practices, such as demarcation of place and duration.

The four branches are now traced separately, taking script or score, performance, place, and recording in turn. Script or score not surprisingly arises firstly with the work of writers and composers, particularly influenced by Cage. The publication *Compositions* (1960) by the Californian composer La Monte Young (b.1935) largely avoids Cage's more diagrammatic or multi-directional experiments with score, to introduce elaborate direction or script, including the use of butterflies, the drawing of lines and accidental or chance options for performers and audience. The works distance performance, without quite excluding it. There are similar developments in dance notation at this time. Young's subsequent collaboration with George Maciunas (1931-78) leads to the formation of the Fluxus group in 1963, an umbrella for similar publications and events. Another Fluxus member and student of Cage, composer George Brecht (b.1925) allows score to become simply script, and offers only the simplest directions for a performer, related only to the most general of

situations, such as a sign indicating direction of travel, to be followed or not.[316] The work still allows performance, but on such general terms as to render it under-determined and effectively redundant. More prominently, it equivocates between rudimentary drama, dance and even music, as well as standing alone or as other literature and even admits to a plastic dimension in the use of a direction sign, as architecture and design.[317] So it offers all arts a part, but only of a radically diminished whole. Perhaps surprisingly, such work remains more of a concern to the plastic arts than to literature or performance, but crucially this is because the plastic arts are the sampler rather than the sampled.

Clearly the script in such cases, given further elaboration, draws closer to traditional literature. To avoid this unwelcome assimilation the work is constrained to a literary and literal minimalism, and at the same time looks to other means of presentation, apart from mere copy or publication. The work accordingly adopts exhibition and like more musical or dance orientated works at this time, uses presence in a gallery and so a projection to the plastic arts as a way of countering a narrower identity. Yet the script or score, treated as a 'text-only' work (as in Chapter Fourteen) encounters a formidable contest of emphasis in sample.[318] For print sampling in painting offers a counter project at this time to text and 'layout', that obscures or sacrifices just those qualities of script preserved in copy, while copy urges indifference to such matters of print and 'layout'. Consequently such works are doubly difficult, and reward or fail where difference between text and script are not maintained. Equally, works such as those of the Art and Language Group, Kossuth and Weiner may be taken to project 'text-only' sampling in the other direction, beyond painting and the art gallery, to publication for example.

Notable works of script and 'text-only' include the exhibition *Working Drawings and Other Visible Things on Paper, Not Necessarily Meant To Be Viewed as Art* (1966)'curated' by Mel Bochner (b.1940) at the New York School of Visual Arts. Bochner collected

---

[316] On Fluxus, see Ken Friedman (editor) *Fluxus Reader*, Chichester/ UK, 1998, Thomas Kellein, *Fluxus*, London, 1995.

[317] Since Cage in an earlier work allows silence as a musical duration - and since the script does not exclude sound - incidental sound or silence may be taken as a 'musical' feature of such works.

[318] The distinction here between script and text is that text refers only to familiar print or publishing formats, while script includes these within a larger category, roughly synonymous with writing.

and photo-copied scripts, scores, sketches, drafts, plans and sundry calculations to demonstrate a familiar grading of script or notation to depiction in loose-leaf folders placed upon plinths through the gallery.[319] Of course where copies involve more than script, they are no longer strictly instances of the script and depiction, but text, print, and records, and Bochner's role more than mere curator. Curiously, this strategy draws little subsequent interest. Whereas script as mere gallery notice, exploited by Robert Barry (b.1936) in his noted exhibition at the Art and Project Gallery in Amsterdam in 1969, in which the work appeared upon the closed doors of the gallery, informing the public that 'during the exhibition the gallery will be closed' does not invite further variation, even from Barry.[320]

Similarly, performance is drawn to the plastic arts in the course of expanding materials, as much as the plastic arts are drawn to performance. Yet each tends to cancel the other, so that Klein's performances reduce painting to utterance and anatomy (male and female) and performance to mere presence of a person. More forthright are the performances and products of Piero Manzoni (1933-63) that follow in 1961, where the artist's breath is collected in balloons, his thumbprints recorded upon them or freshly boiled eggs (later distributed and eaten by the audience) or, more notoriously, his excrement collected in sealed cans (mercifully, not as a performance). And where means are relaxed as far as to allow a felt-tip pen, he signs – significantly – the bared limbs of willing members of the audience, as conspicuously temporary products.[321] Performance stripped of the artist's skills and sampled by only scant particulars of anatomy, obviously samples only the stark or minimal person. Performance parallels the Minimalism of painting and sculpture in this respect.[322] Likewise, the course of Post-Modernist performance is one of cautious expansion of means against ends, but concludes where means revert to distinct categories of music, dance and drama, or where the increasing availability and sophistication of video offers another art.

---

[319] On Bochner, see Richard S. Field, (ed.) *Mel Bochner: Thought Made Visible 1966-73* (catalogue) New Haven, 1995.

[320] The work also recalls Duchamp's 'dance score' *Relache* (1924), consisting of a notice of cancellation at the door of the theatre.

[321] On Manzoni, see Germano Celant, *Piero Manzoni*, Milan, 1998 and Piero Manzoni, *Piero Manzoni* (catalogue) *Paintings, Reliefs, and Objects,* London, 1974.

[322] On performance, see Gregory Battcock and Robert Nickas (eds.) *The Art of Performance: a critical anthology*, New York, 1984 and Nick Kaye, *Site-specific art: performance, place and documentation*, London, 2000.

But to begin with, the minimal person is sampled by the minimal performance. The performer's actions are not pretence or acting, but actual and tend to focus upon automatic or involuntary responses to a variously challenging situation or task. Tasks and responses range from the traumatic, as in the bloody crucifixions of Austrian Herman Nitsch (b.1938) such as *First Action* (1962) to the trivial, as in the simple tasks performed by Nauman such as *Self Portrait as a Fountain* (1966-7) where the artist squirts water from his mouth[323]. Tasks may also elicit emotional responses as well as simple motor co-ordination skills. Yet since the 'performances' are usually self-imposed, the emotions elicited are not quite clear-cut, the more elaborate and onerous the task performed and emotion generated - or even the more frivolous – only serves to underline the performer's 'real' motives and emotions to the undertaking. Does the audience witness mere distress or masochism, deft co-ordination or vanity? It is this uneasy blend between what is and is not a performance, and what exactly is sampled and expressed that stimulates much Post-Modernist performance.

More elaborate tasks and responses follow. The importance of props and even place involved in the task become more prominent. Even the minimal performance requires props, if anything, places greater emphasis upon them, since the performer's use of them is often extremely intimate. Squirted water, shed clothing, a scuffed floor or wall, even the echo of a hall or gallery, all carry some of the performer's response to tasks or situations, and are an important part of the physical and emotional expression. Yet where the performance absorbs the props in this way, the performance also loses definition to some extent. The minimal person cannot do without props, but cannot really compete with them either. Exploiting this tendency with peculiar dedication, the early performances of Joseph Beuys such as *The Chief – Fluxus Chants* (1963-4) literally smother the performer in props.[324] The nine-hour performance involved the performer (Beuys) wrapped inside a roll of felt upon the floor and virtually inert throughout, a dead hare protruding from either end of the roll, edges of the floor and walls sealed with fat, while he broadcast a series of low squeals or groans through a microphone to speakers in the gallery and

---

[323] On Nauman, see Currentartpics 22.
[324] On Beuys, see Caroline Tisdall, *Joseph Beuys*, London, 1979, and Germano Celant, *The European Iceberg: Creativity in Germany and Italy Today,* New York, 1985.

outside, interspersed with tapes of popular music. Here the performance is literally absorbed into the surrounding material, and while muffled in one respect, is yet transmitted to the gallery and beyond. The audio transmission stands as at least a metaphor for a more thoroughgoing one. From the performer's emotional state to the chain of surrounding materials, organic and inorganic, across various seals and insulation and back – his disturbing and inchoate cries finally make the minimal person only the most vocal of props.

Yet the minimal person, as a kind of psychic conduit to surroundings, is not always so lost for words. Beuy's later performances tend to stress the verbal, indeed become informal lectures on a range of topical issues, complete with blackboards filled with successive summary diagrams. The minimal performance *as* a lecture is a less certain project in other respects. Neither distinctive costume, persona nor location quite 'out-project' mere lecturing. In general, Post-Modernist performance gradually allows greater verbal response in a work, concedes to the scripted and scriptable. It resists additional performers, although often invites audience participation of some kind. The partnership of London-based Gilbert and George (German Gilbert Proesch b. 1943, Englishman George Passmore b. 1942) is a notable exception, ignores interaction and literally doubles their act, as in the choreographed miming in *The Singing Sculpture* (1969-71). In this respect they too concede to dance, makeup and costume. All of which are present in a contrasting work, *Interior Scroll* (1975) by Carolee Schneeman (b.1939) where the performance pointedly ranges from the intimately bodily to an amusingly dry reading.[325] Each step, of course, expands upon the minimal person and performance, while reducing the pull of the plastic arts. Post-Modernist performance gradually dissipates by the end of the nineteen seventies, not just because the plastic arts have less to offer, or fail to project any further, but because dance, music and drama now offer more. The dance of Meredith Monk (b.1943) or German Pina Bausch (b.1940), the drama of Robert Wilson (b.1941), and the music of Laurie Anderson (b.1947) for example, all draw performance into other, more promising hybrids.[326]

---

[325] On Gilbert and George, see Wolf Jahn, *The Art of Gilbert and George or an aesthetic of existence*, London, 1989 and Currentartpics 29. For *Interior Scroll,* see Carolee Schneeman and Bruce McPherson (eds.) *More Than Meat Joy: Complete Performance Works & Selected Writings,* New York, 1979.

[326] These developments are usefully summarised in Marvin Carlson, *Performance: a critical introduction,* London/ New York, 1996, pp. 101-120.

Indeed as dance and drama explore 'site-specific' performances, admit improvisation, mime, acrobatics and other skills, the cautious concessions to the minimal performance look increasingly forlorn, even inept. A common criticism in the late seventies is that it falls too often and easily into poor or 'bad' drama, dance or music, (and scripts equally into 'bad' poetry or prose, even criticism) in comparison with traditional projects. An obvious parallel arises then with developments in 'bad' painting at this time. Yet this holds more for script and performance than for place or recording, which equally confront competing projects. Performance of the minimal person persists in video recording, although here too increasingly elaborate production would seem to draw it into the project of film and television. But film and television is also the most recent and complex of the arts, and its own controversies effectively weaken projection to or from it.[327]

Unfortunately constraints of length prevent tracing this direction. The shift from minimal performance to 'bad' performance leads in turn to fewer but more elaborate variations in the mid eighties, but these are part of a larger periodic shift. The experiments with place likewise bring the work of 'expanded materials' into competition with civic custom and architecture. But resulting work is rarely seen as 'bad' architecture or civic planning; on the contrary, over the course of Post-Modernism such works are steadily absorbed or accommodated by architecture and civic custom.

It is easy enough to track the emergence of place in this sense, and to match it roughly with the start of Post- Modernism. But it is more difficult to find its course coinciding with Post-Modernism as proposed here. However, to begin with there is the greater prominence of the gallery itself as a space or place. Klein's *Le Vide* (1958) strips the gallery of its fittings, repaints the walls white, *Le Plein* (1960) by Frenchman Arman (Armand Fernandez b.1928) completely fills the same gallery (Galerie Iris Clert in Paris) with debris and various discarded materials. Both sample a containment of architecture for a duration – or an 'installation' – notably without

---

[327] A key example of this division from the time is Peter Wollen 'The Two Avant-Gardes' in *Studio International,* December 1975, pp. 171-175 (reprinted in Peter Wollen, *Readings and Writings* London, 1982, pp. 92-104). Significantly the debate initially occurs in an art rather than film journal.

the motion or technology of Hamilton or Fontana's displays. Similarly, the conflation of shop and gallery in Oldenburg's *The Store* (1961) give the work a specific place and time (of lease). The spread to less likely places, materials and durations extends from *The Dockside Packages at Cologne* (1961) by French couple, Christo (Christo Javacheff b.1935) and wife, Jeanne-Claude (b.1935) to the earthworks of Oldenburg, Michael Heizer (b.1944) and Dennis Oppenheim (b.1938) in 1967 and to larger-scale 'Land Art' and even 'Sky Art' works by the end of the decade.[328] At the same time the use of less solid or stable materials within a gallery and installation amplify duration in other ways, from the less manageable 'spill' and 'scatter' works of Carl Andre (b.1935), Serra, Le Va and Morris to the noisier, smellier, even tastier installations of Beuys, Jannis Kounellis (b.1936) Lucio Fabro (b.1936) and others, featuring among carved and moulded fat, dead hares and prepared meat, live macaws and horses, pot plants and vegetables, lit candles and gas flames, playing radios, television and tapes.[329] Later installation also tends to blur the distinction with exhibition, to include stand-alone and long-term works with more temporary elements, as in the installations of Jonathan Borofsky (b.1942) or combine painting with installed materials as in the work of Judy Pfaff (b.1946) in the late seventies.

But where work samples place on a longer term, as in the Land Art works of Heizer, Walter de Maria (b.1935) or Robert Smithson (1938-73) duration is not necessarily the prominent issue. Where works use industrial earthmoving equipment to create something closer to landscape gardening, works are drawn irresistibly to architecture and engineering. Short-term works persist through the seventies, such as the more restrained Land Art works of Englishmen Richard Long (b.1943) and Hamish Fulton (b.1946) the more expansive projects of Christo and Jeanne-Claude, the installations of Italian Eugenio Carmi (b.1920) of Viallat and the Surface and Support group in France, and the sledge hammer and chain-saw 'carvings' in derelict and condemned buildings by Gordon Matta-Clark (1945-78). But familiarity now specialises the emphasis in such works. Duration here comes to stress either

---

[328] On these American artists, see Alexander Alberro and Patricia Norvell (eds.) *Recording Conceptual Art*, London/Los Angeles, 2001. On Kounellis, see Gloria Moure (ed) *Jannis Kounellis: works, writings 1958-2000*, New York, 2000

[329] Something of this attention to a wider sensory sample is captured in the term Arte Povera, and often used to distinguish between European and American installations. See Germano Celant, *Arte Povera*, New York, 1969, Carolyn Christov-Bakargiev, (ed.) *Arte Povera*, London, 1999.

increasing civic co-operation, or in the case of many British and American works, a recalcitrant isolation, in the case of Matta-Clark, often a naked demolition or vandalism.

But while duration and place for Conceptual Art do not strictly last the course of Post-Modernism as proposed, two tendencies that follow from works of place do climax in the mid-eighties, and so correspond to the sought end of Post-Modernism. The first of these follows from the architectural strain to Land Art, and leads firstly to sculpture of basic buildings, such as *Low Building with Dirt Roof* (for Mary) (1973) by Alice Aycock (b.1946) and then to larger, more industrial structures, such as her series titled *How to Catch and Manufacture Ghost Stories from the Workhouse* (1979-80) with their sprawling and kinetic elements (including performance) industrial materials and imposing scale.[330] Similar features are found in the work of Oppenheim, Dan Graham (b.1942), Vito Acconci (b.1940) Siah Armajani (b.1939) and others at this time. But the play with industrial architecture leads not only to more playground-like works but also to increasing use of commercial fabrication of components, to the artist as more of a designer or architect and to the work's integration within broader architectural projects, such as the gardens and walkways designed by Mary Miss (b.1944) at *Laumeier Park* (1985) in St Louis.[331] On the one hand the pursuit of place and duration ends in the sub-branches of architecture, on the other, the increasing reliance upon standard fabrication shifts the emphasis to another kind of integration. This announces an end of Post-Modernism.

The second tendency follows from the increasing co-operation available for works of place. It feeds and feeds off a widespread growth in funding and administration of such events throughout the seventies, largely throughout the western world. Public art programmes, arts festivals, artists-in-residence schemes and further venues and facilities all use and shape the short-term work of place in this period. Either institutional opportunity promotes a greater boldness, even extravagance to

---

[330] On such work, see Rosalind E. Krauss, 'Sculpture in The Expanded Field' in *The Originality of the Avant-Garde and Other Modernist Myths*, Cambridge/Mass./ London, 1986, pp. 277-290

[331] Attention to industrial architecture is prompted possibly by the preceding engagement with large-scale earth-moving equipment in the Land Art works of Smithson or Heizer, by questions of scale and materials, similar to those found in Late Modernism, and by the growing popularity for the photographic catalogues of industrial architecture by Bernd and Hilla Becher.

site-specific works, or places are negotiated with their constituents or community. The split is between what the work can do with a place *as* community, and what the community can do with a work *as* place. Place now becomes less a matter of remote or open spaces than of distinctive urban functions. Certain buildings for example are offered to mural projects whose themes increasingly reflect local concerns, so that physical structure, space and duration are less an issue than community projection of a collective identity. Obviously the artist interested in material issues in unlikely to be the same one to respond to community needs, but at the same time to work further *with* a place, is to work with its community and to exchange means.[332] Moreover, the work is increasingly a collective, and often urgently political and educational task. Groups such as Collaborative Projects (Colab) and Group Material in New York in the late seventies typify this trend.[333] Finally community concerns are also directed back to other varieties of the plastic and applied arts, and to their grouping in exhibitions and collections as Identity Art. The identity is of a community or sub-culture, variously constructed according to place, history, religion, race, economic status, ability, age or sexuality.[334] Where performance begins as the minimal person, place here ends as the social stereotype. This transition culminates in the mid eighties and marks another end to Post-Modernism.

Finally, there is recording in Conceptual Art, and since we forego film and video, and audio recordings form only a small part of the style, recording of performance and place by photography, is briefly traced. As noted, recording may also influence how a performance or event is constructed. While many Conceptual Art works employ photography to document or record events, much as painting or sculpture

---

[332] The issue of how place or site is defined in relation to community remains controversial. For example the removal of Serra's 'site-specific' sculpture *Tilted Arc* (1981) from Federal Plaza in New York City in March 1989, was contested on the grounds of spatial or architectural integrity of the work as well as contractual obligation, notably ignoring the adverse response from the surrounding buildings' occupants, and users of the space. See Robert Storr, 'Tilted Arc: Enemy of the People?' in *Art in America,* September 1985, pp. 90-97, Harriet F. Senie, *The Tilted Arc Controversy: Dangerous Precedent*, Minneapolis, 2001.

[333] On Group Material, see Brian Wallis (ed.), *Democracy: A Project by Group Material*, Seattle, 1990, Suzi Gablik, 'Report from New York: The Graffiti Question' in *Art in America*, October 1982, p.37, and William Oleander, 'Material World', in *Art in America*, October 1989, p. 124.

[3] On Identity Art, see Lucy Lippard, *Get The Message? A Decade Of Social Change*: New York. 1984, Hal Foster: 'Artist as Ethnographer' in *Return of the real: the avant-garde at the end of the century*, Cambridge/Mass./London, 1996, W.J.T. Mitchell (ed.) *Art and the Public Sphere*, Chicago, 1992, Robert Storr 'Identity' in *Art 21: Art in the Twenty First Century*, New York, 2001.

are regularly documented, photography is also quickly seized upon as a more formative feature to the work of performance, duration or place. It allows for example, for fictive works, such as Klein's *Leap into The Void* (1960) where the artist appears to be caught mid-dive, from on high onto the bare pavement of a quiet street in Paris, and its novel presentation in a print format (in a small newspaper, 'for one day', devoted solely to the artist's activities). It allows for more mobile and in a sense, private performances, and for tacit 'visual' elements not easily devised or recorded in a script, score or plan, such as in the documented 'actions' of Acconci, Nauman, Oppenheim, Adrian Piper (b.1948) Ana Mendieta (1948-85) and Brazilians Helio Oiticica (1937-80) and Lygia Clark (1920-88), as well as striking points of view, such as the aerial photography used by Smithson or Oppenheim for certain Land Art works, the angles and architectural details to Matta-Clark's demolitions and the distant views of remote Land Art works adopted by Long and Fulton.

Yet photographs as records also require captions and 'layout' to properly point to events, and these too are distinctive in Conceptual Art. While recording here converges with other interests in script or score, 'layout' and print, recording is initially stressed in the prosaic nature of the photography and 'layout'. Yet even as the recording of the work as an event or place is urged, 'layout' and caption build a second work, around the work. 'Layout' of photographs and captions is often amusingly strained in such works for sequence and salience. Captions are often terse or vague. Photographs are often uninformative or misleading.[335] The work as a record, often points to the vagaries of events and recording practices. The work here is thus one of divided identity, between record, event and even script or score, in a way striking to the plastic arts, although quite the norm in filmmaking or music recording. But the 'real' event does not elude such recording, anymore than such recording eludes preceding practices, in a phantom concept. Rather, event and record find and make other kinds of events and practices.

---

[335] See for example Acconci's 'layout' of photographs for *Security Zone* (1971) where persons are largely rendered in distant silhouette hence of uncertain identity or attitude, matters supposedly sampled by the performance, and equally uncertain sequence. On Acconci, see Vito Acconci and Kate Linker, *Vito Acconci*, New York, 1994.

Indeed the wider practices of photography and caption become the focus of further Conceptual works throughout the seventies, just as performance and place also change, and just as painting tires of them, as print samples. Works by Graham, Bill Beckley (b.1946) German Hans Haacke (b.1936) Englishman Victor Burgin (b.1941) French Christian Boltanski (b.1944) and others pursue standard typefaces, script or copy, photographic techniques and often found or acquired photographs, to factual and fictive objects in often strange or disturbing contexts. Practices may be pursued to publication, to their inclusion in popular magazines, or to billboards or posters. Graham's pioneering 'Figurative' in *Harper's Bazaar* (March 1968) supplies an enlarged supermarket receipt, disturbs the overall layout of advertising and urges a blunt financial dimension to the usual claims for personal hygiene and attraction.[336] Practice is thus tested and adjusted in a small way by fully participating in such publication, and yet unavoidably also functions as just an advertisement for the artist (his name and the title of the work are included beside the list) and the enlightened acceptance of the publication. Challenge thus extends no further than the nature of the advertisement, indeed reflects perhaps more favourably on surrounding products than the artist.[337]

'Layout' practices are also pursued to the gallery or exhibition, for captions or wall-plaques, catalogue and attribution texts. The work of Haacke at this time elicits various social and economic statistics for gallery or exhibition, more controversially, offers copious provenance or history not only for works, but collections, collectors, patrons, administrators and prevailing financial arrangements. The challenge here is not simply one of propriety, but whether the practice is not out-projected by, or more efficiently pursued as journalism.[338] Other work ranges between such practices and publication. At a certain point in Conceptual Art, events and place are less important than the recording, and at a certain point recording is less important than its 'layout' and influence, and by the eighties the cooperation and access to such practices becomes a more prominent sample in such work than either recording or

---

[336] Later such placements target more specialised publications, notably art journals such as *Art Forum*, *Studio International* and *Flash Art*, in the seventies and early eighties.

[337] On Graham, see Alexander Alberro and Patricia Novell, (eds.) *Recording Conceptual Art*, Los Angeles and London, 2001 and Alexander Alberro (ed.) *Two-way Mirror Power: Selected writings by Dan Graham on his art*, Cambridge/Mass./ London, 1999.

[338] On Haacke, see Brian Wallis (ed.) *Hans Haacke Unfinished business*, Cambridge/ Mass./London, 1986, Benjamin Buchloh, 'Hans Haacke: Memory and Instrumental Reason' in *Art in America*, February, 1988, pp. 96-109.

'layout', for example in the publication and distribution of works by Barbara Kruger (b.1945) and Jenny Holzer (b.1950).[339]

Thus works of 'expanded materials' mostly gain in organisation under the proposed periods of Late and Post-Modernism. Importantly, they synchronise with fundamental concerns in painting, and correct and co-ordinate misleading notions of Conceptual Art. A larger, clearer picture of the periods emerges, perhaps prompts a more revealing name than Post Modernism, and so helps to frame the following chapter on the closing period to the century.

---

[339] On Kruger, see Kate Linker, *Love for Sale: The words and pictures of Barbara Kruger*, New York, 1990. On Holzer, see David Joselit, *Jenny Holzer: (All Works and Artist's Writings)* London/ New York, 1998.